## Al and Health Solutions in Nursing: Optimizing Patient Care

#### Judy Murphy, DN (hon), RN, FACMI, LFHIMSS, FAAN

Nurse Exec & Health IT Leader Former IBM CNO; Former ONC Deputy Director; Former Aurora VP-IT





2024 Trends in Clinical Informatics Spring Program, May 17, 2024

## What we will cover

- AI in Health IT Strategy & Organizational Culture
  - Health IT Hierarchy of Needs
  - Development Lifecycle & Implementation
  - Organizational Readiness
- Guiding Principles for AI in Healthcare
  - Responsible, Safe & Ethical Use
  - Operationalizing the Guiding Principles
  - Government Regulation
  - Governance
- Nursing & Healthcare AI Use Cases
  - Value Propositions and Examples:
    - ✓ Supporting Patient Care
    - ✓ Supporting Patient Experience
    - ✓ Supporting Workforce
  - Pitfalls to Avoid
- AMIA 25x5 Task Force Update

### Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs



health, employment, property, family and social ability

#### **PHYSIOLOGICAL NEEDS**

breathing, food, water, shelter, clothing, sleep

#### "We can only reach our full potential after our basic needs are met."

## Healthcare IT Hierarchy of Needs

"AI does not meet healthcare technology needs on its own"



"The promise of AI in healthcare is built upon the success of the past 3 decades in digitizing our core processes"

Credit: Daniel Barchi, 2023 CIO CommonSpirit Health

4

## The Importance of Interoperability in AI

- Types of Interoperability: o
  - ility: o Technical (communication)
    - Syntactic (format, structure)
    - Semantic (nomenclature)
    - Organizational (business processes, polices)
- One of the largest barriers for applying AI to healthcare and building scalable solutions is not a lack of algorithms, but a **lack of suitable data** for developing AI applications.



- Al relies on growing volumes of digital healthcare data to use Al algorithms/big data analytics to their capacity and feed them with maximum input, processing information from different systems and across institutional boundaries is crucial.
  - Micro Example: Analysis of a patient's health data requires information from general practitioners, hospitals, laboratories, mobile health apps, wearable sensors, and SDOH data sources
  - Macro Example: Multiple data sources are necessary when data are scarce, for example, in the areas of rare diseases, precision medicine, or pharmacogenomics; tailoring treatments and drugs small subpopulations of patients requires a large pool of comparable data, making it necessary to exchange information across systems, institutions, and countries
- Interoperability solutions are needed to support technical and business agreements between parties providing data and services, including knowledge services such as ML and AI
- Computable expression of consent and ethics policies are needed to **control how patient information is used**, including compliance with local guiding principles and regulative rules

### Status of Healthcare AI – Gartner Hype Cycle

#### Hype Cycle for Healthcare Data, Analytics and Al, 2023



Credit: Jeff Cribbs, Gartner Research, Hype Cycle for Healthcare Data, Analytics and AI, 24 July 2023.



Reference: Ng M., Kapur S, Blizinsky K, Hernandez-Broussard T. The AI lifecycle: a holistic approach to creating ethical AI for health decisions. Nature Medicine, 2022.

### Responsible Approach to AI Implementation – Moving from Development to Operations



## **Organizational Readiness**

Organization's Motivation	÷	Organization's Capabilities	
Mission, Vision, Strategic Goals		Tech Infrastructure	Governance
Data Sharing Philosophy		Staff Competence	Resources

Reference: Youssef A, Ng M, Hernandez-Broussard T, Shah N, Miner A, Larsen D, Langlotz C. Organizational Factors in Clinical Data Sharing for AI in Health Care. JAMA Network Open. 2023 Dec 1;6(12):e2348422.

Forrester AI Applications in Healthcare & Life Sciences Report, Feb 2024

> Most organizations are in the early stages of Al implementation



6%



Forrester AI Applications in Healthcare & Life Sciences Report, Feb 2024

> The biggest threats to successful adoption are poor data, privacy concerns, and lack of internal skills

> > Credit: Forrester Opportunity Snapshot: A Custom Study Commissioned by Salesforces, Feb 2024.



Forrester AI Applications in Healthcare & Life Sciences Report, Feb 2024

> Most organizations are not ready for widespread adoption





## Leadership



Health systems who are embracing AI are hiring Chief Al Officers and other AI leaders as point-persons for how the technology is assessed, piloted, strategically applied, and integrated across their organizations - as well as how it is evaluated, monitored and governed for *adherence to their Guiding Principles for Use of AI*

#### • 3 Emerging Role Phenotypes:

- Operations: implementing AI into the workflow to improve EHR management and advance other operational aspects from HR to billing to revenue cycle and beyond; <u>leaders w/clinical</u>, <u>healthcare informatics background</u>
- Transformation: integrating AI more broadly to improve operational efficiency and update existing care models to harness the potential of AI tools; <u>leaders w/bioinformatics or computer</u> <u>science background</u>
- Research and Innovation: focusing on the research/development end of creating new AI tools that can be implemented to innovate healthcare processes across diagnostics, treatment and experience; <u>leaders w/research, PhD background</u>

## AMIA's Guiding Principles for Responsible, Safe & Ethical Use of AI in Healthcare

### 1. Transparency

- 2. Explainability
- 3. Equity
- 4. Nonbiased
- 5. Autonomous
- 6. Beneficence
- 7. "Do no Harm"
- 8. Interpretability

9. Dependability 10. Auditability 11. Knowledge Mgt 12. Benevolence 13. Accountability 14. Vulnerable populations 15. Al Research 16. User Education

Adapted from: Solomonides A, Koski E, Atabaki S, Weinberg S, McGreevey J, Kanry J, Petersen C, Lehmann C: Defining AMIA's Al principles. JAMIA, 2022:29(4), 585-591.



#### Trustworthy AI For An Equitable Healthcare Future (from HIMSS)



#### Do you trust your AI models?

Our trust in technology relies on understanding how it works. We need to understand why AI makes the decisions it does to make AI more *explainable, fair, robust, private, and transparent.* 

#### **\* 85%**

of consumers say that it is important for organizations to factor in ethics as they use AI to tackle society's problems. of business executives view ethics as a source of competitive differentiation and see it as a core initiative.

**75%** 

#### i្ដី <20%

of respondents strongly agreed that their organization's practices and actions match (or exceed) their stated principles and values.

#### **The Intention-Action Gap**

Organizations are endorsing AI ethics principles — but are still catching up on implementing them.



#### **7 PILLARS OF TRUSTWORTHY AI**



Credit: HIM\$S. 7 Pillars of Trustworthy Al. https://www.himss.org/sites/hde/files/trustwo rthy-ai-for-an-equitable-healthcare-future.pdf

## **References for Guiding Principles**

ΔΝΔ

#### ETHICS AND GOVERNANCE OF ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE FOR HEALTH

WHO GUIDANCE



ANA AMERICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION

Principles for Augmented Intelligence Development, Deployment, and Use

Position Paper Defining AMIA's AI Principles

Approved by AMA Board of Trustees on November 14, 2023



Your trusted guide to rigorous evaluation of clinical applications of AI.



**POSITION STATEMENT** 

#### The Ethical Use of Artificial Intelligence in

Nursing Practice



**OECD AI Principles overview** 

#### Health Care Artificial Intelligence Code of Conduct

Toward a Code of Conduct Framework for Artificial

NATIONAL ACADEMY OF MEDICINE



#### Artificial Intelligence in Health, Health Care, and Biomedical Science: An <u>Al Code of Conduct</u> Principles and Commitments Discussion Draft

By Laura Adams, Elaine Fontaine, Steven Lin, Trevor Crowell, Vincent C. H. Chung, and Andrew A. Gonzalez, editors

#### Published April 8, 2024



https://nam.edu/artificial-intelligence-in-health-health-care-and-biomedicalscience-an-ai-code-of-conduct-principles-and-commitments-discussion-draft/

A proposed A.I. warning label would provide more detail into how tech companies use personal data to train A.I. models. (Referenced in the NTIA AI Accountability Policy Report 03/27/24.) https://nutrition-facts.ai/

#### **AI Nutrition Facts**

Your Product Name

Description Describe your product	
Privacy Ladder Level	1
Feature is Optional	Yes
Model Type G	ienerative
Base Model Open	AI - GPT-4
Trust Ingredients	
Base Model Trained with Customer Data	No
Customer Data is Shared with Model Vendor	No
Journey prompts are NOT used for training	
OpenAl models	
Training Data Anonymized	N/A
Data Deletion	Yes
Journey inferences deleted after 30 days	
Human in the Loop	Yes
User sees output immediately in UI	
User must choose to publish journey	
Data Retention	30 days
Compliance	
Logging & Auditing	N/A
Guardrails	N/A
Input/Output Consistency	Yes
Other Resources Add any additional resources	

## Operationalizing Responsible AI Principles; Forming Learning Collaborations with Like-Minded Organizations



A diverse array of stakeholders who listen, learn, and collaborate to drive the development, evaluation, and appropriate use of Al in healthcare; keeping patients, their families and communities, as the focus of attention,

https://www.coalitionforhealthai.org/

## NURSING AND ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE LEADERSHIP (NAIL) COLLABORATIVE

Vision: To reimagine and transform nursing with AI.

**Mission:** We focus on nurses- the largest sector of healthcare providers worldwide- and believe that every nurse has the right to use cutting-edge AI tools to advance people's health. Our mission is to

advocate, educate, and study health AI tools to make them safe, equitable, and user-friendly.







https://www.nailcollab.org/home



.....

## **Government Regulation & Guidelines**



- Cures Act: Seamless and Secure Access, Exchange, and Use of EHR Information Final Rule, 05/01/2020.
- [HTI-1] Health Data, Technology, and Interoperability: Certification Program Updates, Algorithm Transparency, and Information Sharing Final Rule, 12/13/2023.
- [HTI-2] Health Data, Technology, and Interoperability: Patient Engagement, Information Sharing, and Public Health Interoperability Proposed Rule, coming in future.



OCTOBER 30, 2023 Executive Order on the Safe, Secure, and Trustworthy Development and Use of Artificial Intelligence

#### OFFICE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET

03/27/24. OMB releases Al safeguards for federal agencies



National Telecommunications and Information Administration

United States Department of Commerce

AI Accountability Policy Report March 27, 2024 Artificial Intelligence Risk Management Framework (AI RMF 1.0)



## **Governance of AI Principles**



January 2023

### Some Definitions ...

**Artificial Intelligence (AI):** ability of a computer system to perform tasks that typically require human intelligence, such as learning, problem-solving, decision making.

#### **Natural Language Processing**

**(NLP):** ability to extract concepts from narrative text.

**Generative AI:** allows users to input a variety of prompts to generate new content, such as text, images, videos, sounds, and other media. It "learns" and is trained on documents and artifacts that already exist online. **Machine Learning (ML):** subset of AI that refers to the ability of a computer system to process large volumes of data and extract meaningful information to address practical problems. Improves its performance over time without being explicitly programmed through supervised or unsupervised learning.

**Algorithm:** set of rules or steps that a computer system follows to solve a problem or perform a task. ML algorithms inform decision support, providing users with evidence based information, alerts, and recommendations to aid decision-making.

Large Language Model (LLM): learning algorithm that can perform a variety of natural language processing (NLP) tasks and is trained to recognize, translate, predict, or generate text and other content.

ChatGPT

Data Analytics – any of these could use AI:

- Descriptive "What happened?"
- Diagnostic "Why did this happen?"
- Predictive "What might happen in the future?"
- Prescriptive "What should we do next?"

Reference: E. Koski, J. Murphy. Artificial Intelligence in Healthcare in <u>Essentials of</u> <u>Nursing Informatics</u>, 7<sup>th</sup> Ed, V. Saba and K. McCormick. New York: McGraw-Hill, 2020.

21

### ANA Nursing Informatics Scope of Practice: Data to Wisdom (DIKW) framework



Increasing interactions and interrelationships

## Healthcare AI Applications: "The Wild, Wild West!"

AI helps screen for SDOH Generative AI may help compile patient registries Chatbot may help people manage effects of tinnitus AI-assisted CT predicts subsequent fracture risk ChatGPT produces easily understood patient instructions Al helps predict heart failure hospitalizations *Permanente Medical Group CEO sees role for AI in VBC* AI-based system detects sleep apnea at home Cleveland Clinic pilots AI sepsis prediction and documentation model Google rolls out suite of health care AI tools Urology-based AI software introduced by GE HealthCare AI verifies, accelerates cancer diagnoses Al could help determine if skin lesions are dangerous ML identifies risk factors for osteoporosis in RA Yale creates governance structure to control AI costs Providence partners with Microsoft on health care AI Al models to predict depression show uneven performance Al may help prevent hospitalizations for chemo toxicity Study: GPT-4 better at diagnosing imaging cases Al may cut trial-and-error prescribing of antidepressants Bill would require CMS to test fraud-detecting AI *ML* identifies drug that might prevent heart fibrosis AI accurately finds interval breast cancers ML may help detect early signs of cancer in blood plasma

## Healthcare AI Value Propositions

# **U**g

### <u>Support Patient</u> <u>Care</u>

- Diagnosis and Treatment Recommendation
- Decision Support
- Outcome
  Improvement
- Precision Medicine
- Population Health Management



### <u>Support Patient</u> Experience

- Enhance
  Engagement
- Foster Adherence
- Streamline
  Participation
- Promote
  Personalization



### <u>Support</u> <u>Workforce</u>

- Reduce Administrative Burden
- Optimize Workflow
- Reduce Cognitive Burden
- Improve Efficiency

## AI Examples – Solutions Supporting Patient Care

- Clinical decision support
- Improve diagnosis accuracy
- Treatment recommendations
- Disease progression or complication prediction and identification
- Personalized and precise interventions tailored to individual
- Increase accuracy of assigning oncology protocols to cancer patients
- Create and advance use of care plans
- Reinforce medication management reconciliation, interactions, errors
- Support Value Based Care (Permanente Medical Group) knowing which patients need high touch, which need to be seen triage for care managers
- Remote monitoring; alert to deterioration or changes trending outside the patient's normal range
- Public health syndromic surveillance
- Image and speech analysis
- Internet of Things (IoT)
- Integrate genomic information into the EHR (Stanford Health Care)
- Clinical Trials Management (Stanford Health Care)



## AI Examples – Solutions Supporting Patient Experience

- Al-powered chatbots and virtual assistants to facilitate customer service schedule appointments, answer medical questions, answer billing questions, and provide healthcare information (Providence Healthcare)
- **Manage inbox messages** triage, label by topic, and route to be managed by appropriate staff medical assistant, teleservice representative, pharmacist, nurse, doctor, etc. (Kaiser Permanente, others/Epic)
- Deliver patient education, enhance clinician teaching and patient learning, translate medical terminology, explain patient visit summary/highlight important information
- Provide reliable medical information about medical conditions and treatments aiding patient decision-making
- Provide recommendations for patient referrals from primary care to specialty care (Providence Healthcare)
- Calculate the estimated date of discharge for inpatients
- Personalized coaching for patients with wearable fitness and health monitors
- Robotic companionship



## AI Examples – Solutions Supporting the Workforce

- **Ambient listening/scribing** for clinical documentation notes (Duke, Atrium Health, UNC Health Care, many others/Epic/Nuance)
- Inbox management triaging/filtering/routing and drafting responses (Providence Healthcare, many others/Epic)



- Draft responses to patient portal questions and messages for the clinicians (Stanford Health Care, many others/Epic 90 customers)
- Task organization: present suggestions/reminders for activities/interventions required during a shift; prioritize and schedule
- Text generation: change of shift reviews, discharge and specialty note summaries
- Al-powered robots to assist healthcare professionals with tasks such as supply delivery, patient education, physical therapy and rehabilitation
- Ambient verbal assistance with policy & procedure instructions
- Staff scheduling and management; Al-powered chatbots assistance for staff
- Write job descriptions and performance evaluations (Providence Healthcare)
- Generative-AI coding application to suggest diagnosis and procedure codes (Epic)
- Tools to create referral, prior auth, denial and appeal letters (Epic)

# CommonSpirit<sup>\*</sup> One organization's AI Use

Clinical Action - Autonomous diagnosis and action

Clinical Insight - Sepsis and stroke detection

Clinical Support - Physician communication and documentation

Patient Engagement - Scheduling

Employee Engagement - Employee service desk

Robotic Process Automation - Back office billing and invoicing

60 full scale AI-based systems that support clinical and operations processes – some examples:

- Inbound phone call automation
- Patient communications ED status updates, appointment scheduling and reminders
- · Service Desk step-by-step instructions on setting up company email on a new phone
- Ambient scribing for documentation
- Inbox management, filtering and routing
- Algorithms to predict or identify sepsis and stroke

Reference: Daniel Barchi, CIO CommonSpirit Health. Al in Healthcare – Embrace the Wolf, Beware the Husky. Published on LinkedIn, 12/13/23.

## Avoid the "Tail Wagging the Dog" and the "Bright Shiny Object" Condition

(the Great AI Solution looking for a Problem to Solve)

- Use AI implementation as a means to an end, and not as an end unto itself – AI is the enabler of practice change
- Plan and execute AI projects as people/process/practice changes facilitated by technology; and not as IT implementations
- Don't forget the importance of workflow integration difficult in a very EHR-centric culture



## Avoid Workarounds to retrofit Solutions into Workflow

An example of trying to support nursing mobile workflow before the technology enabled mobility ...





## Involve practicing nurses in the planning

### San Francisco Chronicle

#### Kaiser nurses protest use of AI that they say could put patient safety at risk

#### By Catherine Ho

April 22, 2024



## Include Patients in Co-creation of AI Solutions

#### **#PatientsUseAI**

### Patients are end users of AI

#### Include actual patient users in leading AI governance.

We have real work to do in managing our care. Our needs and uses are our own. Remember the patient rallying cry: "Nothing about us without us."

#### Medical work patients do with AI:

administrative burden





for action



literature)



Exploring knowledge & options

Reference: 'e-Patient Dave' deBronkart blog, April 2, 2024: "Include patient users in co-creation of AI and related policy." https://www.epatientdave.com/blog/

## **Al Rights For Patients**

Written By Patients Experts and Community Leaders

Version 1.0, Mar 22, 2024

https://lightcollective.org/patient-ai-rights/



The embrace of AI in Nursing isn't just a leap forward in technological terms; it's a step closer to the heart of what healthcare promises to be: a haven of human touch, improved by the precision of evidence-based intelligent decision management support systems.



Reference: Domondon, B. Why Nurses? Embracing Al Synergy of Care with Nursing Roles, <u>Medium</u>, Mar 19 2024

## Update on AMIA's 25 x 5 Initiative



2024 Trends in Clinical Informatics Spring Program, May 17, 2024

#### Mission

A U.S. healthcare workforce free of documentation burden, focused on patient care and improved outcomes.

#### Vision

Reduce U.S. health professionals' documentation burden to 25% of current state within five years. Optimize and spread across health systems impactful solutions that decrease non-value-added documentation and leverage partnerships and advocacy with health systems, professional societies, and public/private sector organizations.

#### **Strategic Goals**

- 1. Wide adoption and utilization of task force tools and exemplars' solutions by health professionals to reduce documentation burden across U.S. healthcare organizations.
- 2. Greater funding for research and process improvements related to mitigation of documentation burden.
- 3. Increased identification of strategic initiatives to reduce burden within U.S. healthcare organizations.
- 4. Improved perception of documentation burden among health professionals.





#### **Use of ANIA's Six Domains of Documentation Burden as a Guiding Framework**

Domain	Definition
Reimbursement	Documentation, coding and administrative charting required for reimbursement, by payors
	such as: CMS, Blue Cross/Blue Shield, United Healthcare, Aetna, Anthem, Cigna, Humana.
Regulatory	Accreditation agency documentation requirements such as: The Joint Commission,
	Healthcare Facilities Accreditation Program and State Regulatory Agencies.
Quality	Documentation required to demonstrate that quality patient care has been provided. This
	includes documentation requirements by the healthcare organization itself, as well as by
	governmental and regulatory agencies.
Usability	Insufficient use of human factors engineering and human-computer interface principles.
	EHRs are not following evidence-based usability/human factors design principles.
Interoperability	Insufficient standards requiring duplication and re-entry of data even though it resides
	elsewhere, either internal to the organization or in an external system.
Self-Imposed:	Organizational culture's influence on what should be documented can exceed what is
"We've done it to	needed for patient care, including fear of litigation, 'we've always done it this way,' and
ourselves"	misinterpretation of regulatory standards. Includes insufficient education on system use.

Reference: Sengstack P, Adrian B, Boyd DL, Davis A, Hook M, Hulett SL, et al. The Six Domains of Burden: A Conceptual Framework to Address the Burden of Documentation in the Electronic Health Record: Position Paper of the American Nursing Informatics Association Board of Directors. 2020.



#### 25x5 Task Force Resources and Activities

- 25x5 Website: <u>https://amia.org/about-amia/amia-25x5</u>
- Slack Community ~ 185 members and growing! JOIN TODAY.
- Publication of 25x5 Symposium Final Summary Report and Executive Summary
- Charter Member of the NBRC (National Burden Reduction Collaborative): <u>https://amia.org/</u> <u>news-publications/amia-and-pacesetters-comprehensively-tackle-burden-reduction-healthcare</u>
- Burden Reduction Toolkit published in spring 2023 ~1000 downloads to date!
  - ✓ Provide feedback via survey: <u>https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/NLZPZKC</u>
- Review of Documentation Burden Reduction Activities
- Logic Model to organize/evaluate 25x5 Task Force Activities
- Publication of **2 Policy Briefs**: Policy Reforms and Reform Prior Authorization
- Six Publications in Peer-Reviewed Journals





#### 25x5 Task Force Resources and Activities

- Hospital Survey to identify if documentation burden is part of the hospital strategic plan (in coordination with HIMSS)
- Successful competitive selection of Documentation Burden as topic for AHRQ Evidence Review, evidence review began Fall 2023 (in process)
- Standardized Definition of Clinical Documentation Burden
  - ✓ Scoping Review in process to reexamine/validate definition; hopeful publication in JAMIA
- HIT Roadmap of Recommendations to Reduce Documentation Burden (in development)
- Recognition program for demonstrating a measurable positive impact on documentation burden (in development)
- TrendBurden Pulse survey for Measuring Clinician Perception of Documentation Burden
  - ✓ First one open in April 2024; will be repeated every 6 months
  - https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/MV6NJDD



#### **LOGIC MODEL**

#### 5 Components to Evaluate Burden Reduction resulting from activities of the 4 Workstreams

- 1. Perceptions of documentation
- 2. Impacts resulting AMIA/25X5 community investigations and thought leadership
- 3. Funding availability
- 4. Rates of burden as organizational strategic initiative
- 5. Rates of utilization and engagement

N = number of measured items for logic model that comprise each component (Total N = 40 items)





## Thanks!

## Open for Discussion/Q&A

Email: judy.murphy29@gmail.com LinkedIn: judy-murphy-dn-hon-rn-facmi-lfhimss-faan-4066442



2024 Trends in Clinical Informatics Spring Program, May 17, 2024